

"Decision-making heuristics in resource allocation in the Finnish Red Cross: rational irrationality in deciding who gets what"

The Cave Rescue Mission

The Research Management Committee is responsible for a number of projects in team building at the University. An emergency meeting has been called because of a crisis in one of the projects for which you are responsible. The project is studying teams under stressful conditions in a remote part of Perthshire. The experiment involves six volunteers living underground in a cave system for fourteen days. The team's only connection to the outside world is a telephone link to the research station at the entrance to the caves. A call for help has been received from the volunteers. Access to the cave has been blocked by a major fall of rock and their only way out is now through a very long and arduous cave system subject to flooding. The local cave rescue team reports that it will be extremely difficult to get them out because the only route into the cave where the team are living is very narrow and when flooded it will only be possible to get one person out each hour. In the circumstances of continuing heavy rainfall it is probable that the rapidly rising water will mean that the rescuers will not be able to bring all of the volunteers to safety before the water completely floods their cave. Through their link to the research station, the volunteers have been made aware of the seriousness of their situation. They have said that they are unwilling to decide on the sequence by which they will be rescued. The responsibility for making this decision now rests with the Research Management Committee: you must decide the order of rescue.

You have 10 minutes before the cave rescue team arrives at the entrance to the cave system.

The Cave Rescue Biographical Backgrounds:

Helen Richardson, Female, Age 34

Helen is married and a homemaker. Her husband is a member of the City Council. She had been a promising psychology student before leaving the university to be married. Helen has four children (ages 7 months to 8 years) and lives in a suburban community near the university. Helen became introduced to the experiment through Owen, with whom she has become involved.

Tozo Nalkoe, Female, age 19

Tozo is single and a pre-med student at Provincial University. Her parents live in Tokyo where her father is a prominent businessman and her mother is chairperson of the Cancer Research Foundation. She has achieved top honours in her classes for the last three years and has been awarded two scholarships for academic achievements. Tozo was voted by her classmates as most likely to succeed and intends to return to Japan and set up free clinic for the poor.

John Simpson, Male, Age 41

John is married and campus coordinator of Catholic Social Services at Provincial University. He has five children (ages 6 years to 19 years). John worked full-time while attending the university and he earned a master's degree in social work. He has become involved in an anti-racist group, which holds frequent protests.

Owen Smith, Male, Age 40

Owen is a landed immigrant and a high school physical education instructor. He is unmarried and is currently unemployed. He is an automobile mechanic by trade. He was involved in a serious car accident four years ago and lost the use of his left hand. Since the accident, he has taken on odd jobs and relied mostly on government assistance. Two

years ago he developed an alcohol problem and is currently attending AA meetings. He is an American and served in Viet Nam where he received several distinguished decorations. Since returning to civilian life, Owen has been unsettled and his drinking became a problem. He came to Canada 5 years ago and met Helen, the wife of a co-teacher.

Suni Vapar, Male, Age 47

Suni is a medical research scientist at the University Hospital. He is recognized as a world authority on the treatment of immune deficiencies. Suni is part of a research team testing a new experimental treatment for the cure of AIDS. He feels that he is getting closer to discovering a cure for AIDS but much of the research data is still in his working notebooks. He recently suffered nervous exhaustion from overwork and volunteered for this project because he felt he needed a break.

Edward Palmerston, Male, Age 59

Edward is married with two grown children who both have their own families. Edward is owner and president of a medium sized manufacturing company. His company employs 250 people and recently has fallen on hard times due to a loss of a major account. Recently, his company has laid off 50 employees and is facing possible bankruptcy. Edward has personally negotiated a major contract for his company and final contract details are awaiting his return to work. This contract, if signed, would guarantee future employment for all 250 employees for at least 10 years. Active socially and politically in the community, Edward's hobby is spelunking (exploring caves) and he intends to write a book on the subject.

Cave Rescue Ranking Sheet Instructions:

Your task is to rank the 6 trapped individuals in order of their rescue by writing each of their names next to a number that indicates their order of rescue. Example: #1 is the first to be rescued, #6 is the last to be rescued.

Order of Rescue:

NAME

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

4. _____

5. _____

6. _____

Cave Rescue Observer's Notes Behaviours that encouraged dialogue and/or consensus:è Behaviours that blocked dialogue and/or consensus:è Did the group appoint a facilitator?è If no, would appointing a facilitator have enhanced theè process? On a scale from one to five (one being poor and five beingè excellent) how effective was the team at reaching a decision? The Cave Rescue Debrief Probing Questions: Did your group establish a decision-making criterion? If so, what was it? Was consensus reached? Did each of you feel your point of view was heard and considered by all other team members? Was anyone unhappy with the outcome? Why? What could other team members have done to make you feel better? Considering your experience in this exercise, what recommendations do you have to improve the dialogue and the consensus process? Some Key Points: The answer to this exercise is that the people involved (those in the cave) should make their own decisions. You should have pushed back and told them they had to decide. This exercise demonstrates that all too often we believe that we are at ease with change, but in fact, we tend to fall back into our old ways of doing things. It is not easy to change our beliefs. Your personal beliefs will always sway your decisions. Adapted from:
http://www.stir.ac.uk/departments/management/management&organisation/teaching/HRM/Units/management_development.htm Additional websites: <http://www.sbu.ac.uk/careers/mfe/grpexe.html>